1	JORDAN D. SEGALL (State Bar No. 281102) jordan.segall@mto.com MARK R. YOHALEM (State Bar No. 243596)				
2	I mark.vonalem@mto.com				
3	ROBIN S. GRAY (State Bar No. 316544) robin.gray@mto.com				
4	MUNGER TOLLES & OLSON LIP				
5 6	350 South Grand Avenue, 50th Floor Los Angeles, California 90071-3426 Telephone: (213) 683-9100 Facsimile: (213) 687-3702				
7	Attorneys for Defendant Walt Disney				
8	Pictures				
9	UNITED STATES	DISTRICT COURT			
10	CENTRAL DISTRIC	CT OF CALIFORNIA			
11					
12	ARTHUR LEE ALFRED, II et al.,	Case No. 2:18-CV-08074-CBM-ASx			
13	Plaintiffs,	STATEMENT OF UNCONTROVERTED FACTS AND			
14	v.	CONCLUSIONS OF LAW IN SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT WALT			
15	WALT DISNEY PICTURES,	DISNEY PICTURES' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT			
16		[Filed concurrently with Defendant's			
17	Defendant,	Notice of Motion and Motion for			
18		Summary Judgment; Declaration of Robin S. Gray, Declaration of Rebecca			
19		Cline; Declaration of Diego Parras; Declaration of David Jessen, Notice of			
20		Lodging; Proposed Order; Proposed * Judgment]			
21		Date: October 19, 2021 Time: 10:00 a.m.			
22		Dept: Courtroom 8B			
23		Judge: Hon. Consuelo Marshall			
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					
	1				

Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
Uncontroverted Facts Pert	aining to Disney's Ride
Disneyland's Pirates of the Caribbean ride (the "Ride") opened in 1967.	• Cline Decl. ¹ ¶ 6.
Riders of Disneyland's Pirates of the Caribbean ride ("Riders") depart from Lafitte's Landing.	• Jessen Decl. ² Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 19:36.
As Riders near a waterfall leading into a cave, a talking pirate's skull warns "there be plundering pirates lurking in every cove" and "Dead men tell no tales."	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 20:03–20:50; Parras Decl. ³ Ex. B [Ride footage] at 5:38-6:00.
Riders then pass through treasure-filled caves where Riders see scenes of skeletons studying a map, drinking rum, clutching gold coins, and steering a ship.	 Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 20:53–21:58. Cline Decl. Ex. B [E-Ticket Magazine] at 26, 30 ("Heaps of jewels and gold spill from canvas bags, and the Pirate ride theme is heard, as if played on the cobweb covered harpsichord. A full-sized skull and crossbones adorns the jewel-encrusted headboard an ironic image, considering the status of the bed's occupant
	Disneyland's Pirates of the Caribbean ride (the "Ride") opened in 1967. Riders of Disneyland's Pirates of the Caribbean ride ("Riders") depart from Lafitte's Landing. As Riders near a waterfall leading into a cave, a talking pirate's skull warns "there be plundering pirates lurking in every cove" and "Dead men tell no tales." Riders then pass through treasure-filled caves where Riders see scenes of skeletons studying a map, drinking rum, clutching gold coins,

The "Cline Decl." refers to the concurrently filed Declaration of Rebecca Cline in Support of Defendant Walt Disney Pictures' Motion for Summary Judgment.

23

24

26

27

² The "Jessen Decl." refers to the concurrently filed Declaration of David Jessen in Support of Defendant Walt Disney Pictures' Motion for Summary Judgment. Timestamps to the video attached to the Jessen Declaration are given in the format [Minutes]:[Seconds].

³ The "Parras Decl." refers to the concurrently filed Declaration of Diego Parras in Support of Defendant Walt Disney Pictures' Motion for Summary Judgment. Timestamps to the video attached to the Parras Declaration are given in the format [Minutes]:[Seconds].

1			
2		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
3			collection of nautical charts at the table attest that mere death and decomposition have not deterred
5			this bold buccaneer from his quest for treasure and the call of the
6			sea. Indeed, his naked skull sports a grin (grotesquely enlarged by the
7			glass clutched in his spindly hand) as he studies a treasure map and
8			plots the course of his next ocean
9			voyage.").
10 11	5.	As Riders pass through the caves, a voice repeats "dead men tell no	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 20:25–20:50.
12		tales."	1900 Flogranij at 20.23–20.30.
13	6.	Before Riders exit the treasure-	Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1068 Program] et 21:05, 21:15
14		filled caves, a voice says there is an "evil curse" that lies upon the	1968 Program] at 21:05–21:15.
15		"bewitched treasure."	• Cline Decl. Ex. B [<i>E-Ticket</i> Magazine] at 30 (" <i>Perhaps ye</i>
16			knows too much Ye've seen the
17			cursed treasure Ye know where it be hidden. These, and other
18			threatening phrases of pirate
19			verbiage reverberate along the narrow stone tunnel and hint of
20			serious consequences to come.").
21 22	7.	Before Riders exit the treasure-	Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland
23		filled cave, a voice says "No fear have ye of evil curses, says you?"	1968 Program] at 20:53–50:58.
24	8.	Riders then see a pirate ship	Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland]
25		attacking a port town in which	1968 Program] at 21:58–22:35.
26		cannons are firing, and a pirate captain aboard the ship shouts,	
27		"We'll see you to Davey Jones!"	
			•

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3	9.	Riders then see a port town being sacked.	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 22:37–26:42.
4 5 6 7 8	10.	Riders pass a "take a wench for a bride" auction, with more drunken pirates chanting "we wants the redhead."	 Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 23:21–24:15. Cline Decl. Ex. B [<i>E-Ticket</i> Magazine] at 32–33 (discussing the scene).
9 10	11.	Riders pass pirates singing "Yo-Ho (A Pirate's Life for Me)."	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 25:04–26:42.
11 12 13	12.	Riders pass a pirate balancing hats on his head, a pirate in the mud with pigs, and a pirate on a bridge missing a shoe.	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 25:10–26:42.
141516	13.	Riders pass a scene of jailed prisoners attempting to use a bone to lure a dog with keys in its mouth over to their cell.	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 26:42–27:11.
17 18 19 20 21	14.	Riders pass pirates in a cave shooting pistols in a room full of barrels labeled "EXPLOSIVO," where the pirates are again singing "Yo-Ho (A Pirate's Life for Me)." The barrels explode.	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 27:11–28:18.
22 23	15.	Riders then go up the waterfall and emerge from the caves below.	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 28:14–28:55.
242526	16.	Riders then pass through the port town again briefly before disembarking.	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 28:40–28:55.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2		Uncontroverted Facts Pertaining to	
3		The Curse of the Black Pear	
4	17.	In the Motion Picture, Jack Sparrow	• Gray Decl. ⁴ Ex. A [Motion
5		and Will Turner team up to rescue Elizabeth Swann and retake the	Picture] at 42:29–44:26.
6		Black Pearl.	
7	18.	A curse has made Captain Hector	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture]
8		Barbossa and his crew immortal skeletons, which is revealed when	at 55:55–57:42, 58:50–100:40.
9 10		they are exposed to moonlight.	
11	19.	Barbossa and his crew sail the <i>Black Pearl</i> .	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 38:08–38:20.
12	20.	Barbossa and his crew seek to	• Gray Dool Ex. A [Motion Dictural
13 14	20.	reverse the curse.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 55:55–57:42, 58:50-100:40.
15	21.	The Motion Picture features the	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture]
16		song "Yo-Ho (A Pirate's Life for Me)."	at 00:40–00:56, 1:36:44–1:36:55, 2:12:44–2:13:03.
17	22.	The Motion Picture features an	Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture]
18		attack on Port Royal.	at 29:40–37:40.
19	23.	The Motion Picture features	Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture]
20		skeleton pirates and cursed treasure.	at 55:55–57:42, 58:50–100:40.
21	24.	The Motion Picture features a	Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture]
22		woman with red hair.	at 51:06–51:19.
2324	25.	The Motion Picture features a pirate	Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture]
25		sleeping with pigs.	at 51:28–51:43.
23		1	

⁴ The "Gray Decl." refers to the concurrently filed Declaration of Robin S. Gray in Support of Defendant Walt Disney Pictures' Motion for Summary Judgment. Timestamps to the Motion Picture attached as Exhibit A to the Gray Declaration are given in the format [Minutes]:[Seconds] or [Hours]:[Minutes]:[Seconds].

$1 \parallel$		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2	26.	The Motion Picture features a dog	
3	20.	in a prison with keys.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 27:19–27:33, 36:00–36:29.
5	27.	The Motion Picture features a watery cavern.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 109:00–1:16:00, 1:43:18–
6			2:01:30.
7 8	28.	The Motion Picture features a prologue set in the Caribbean.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 0:23–4:52.
9 10 11	29.	The Motion Picture features a woman who is captured after being chased by pirates.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 34:22–34:50.
12 13	30.	The Motion Picture features a final battle in a cave.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:43:18–2:01:30.
14 15	31.	In the Motion Picture's prologue, a ship leaves civilization.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 0:23–1:02.
16 17 18	32.	In the Motion Picture's prologue, a young Elizabeth Swan finds a survivor of a shipwreck, a young Will Turner.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 2:22–4:05.
19 20	33.	In the Motion Picture's prologue, Elizabeth steals Will's medallion.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 4:08–4:18.
21 22	34.	In the Motion Picture's prologue, Elizabeth spots a pirate ship fading into the fog.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 4:44–4:52.
23 24 25 26 27	35.	After the prologue, Elizabeth is now a young woman attending Captain James Norrington's promotion to Commodore in the British Royal Navy.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 10:47–11:38.

	Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
36.	Norrington asks Elizabeth to marry him.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 14:30–15:05.
37.	Elizabeth cannot breathe in her corset and faints, falling into the sea.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 15:00–15:07.
38.	As Elizabeth falls, it is revealed she is wearing the medallion she stole from Will.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 15:38–15:42.
39.	When the medallion hits the water, it emits a pulse.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 15:40–15:44.
40.	Jack Sparrow is in Port Royal to steal a ship.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 13:30–14:00.
41.	Sparrow sees Elizabeth fall and reluctantly jumps in to save her.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 15:24–15:37.
42.	Norrington recognizes Sparrow from a tattoo and attempts to arrest him.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 17:25–17:44.
43.	Sparrow flees into a workshop where he runs into Will.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 20:45–20:58.
44.	Will is an apprentice to a drunken blacksmith.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 7:06–7:56, 21:10–21:30, 22:10–22:19.
45.	Will despises pirates.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 22:38–22:50.
46.	Will engages Sparrow in a sword fight and captures him.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 22:54–27:00.

$_{1}\parallel_{\Gamma}$		•••	
<u>, </u>		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 - 3 -	47.	The <i>Black Pearl</i> lays siege to Port Royal.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 29:40–29:50.
4 - 5 -	48.	Two pirates capture Elizabeth.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 34:22–34:50.
5 - 7 -	49.	Elizabeth conceals her identity by saying her last name is Turner.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 39:37–39:48.
9	50.	Elizabeth demands to see their captain.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 34:22–34:45.
1 -	51.	Pirates visit Sparrow in his jail cell.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 36:38–37:25.
3 - 4 5 -	52.	As one pirate reaches through the bars of Sparrow's cell, his arm is revealed as skeletal in the moonlight.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 37:05–37:20.
5 - 7 -	53.	Elizabeth meets Barbossa aboard the <i>Black Pearl</i> and urges him to leave the port.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 38:08–40:15.
9 -	54.	Barbossa agrees to leave the port and takes Elizabeth hostage.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 40:07–41:00.
1	55.	Will asks Sparrow for his help saving Elizabeth.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 42:29–44:26.
2 - 3 -	56.	Will and Sparrow set off for Tortuga to assemble a crew.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 48:26–50:29.
4 - 5 6 7 <u>-</u>	57.	Will learns Sparrow used to be the captain of the <i>Black Pearl</i> and that Barbossa mutinied and marooned Sparrow.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 105:40–107:42.

	Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
58.	Elizabeth dines with Barbossa on the <i>Black Pearl</i> .	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 53:59–55:55.
59.	Barbossa explains that his men found the gold of Cortes, but realized too late that the treasure was cursed, turning Barbossa and his men into immortal skeletons, whose true skeleton nature is revealed by moonlight.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 55:55–57:42, 58:50–100:40.
60.	The <i>Black Pearl</i> reaches Isla de la Muerta, where Cortes' gold is kept.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 104:04–104:53, 108:00–108:14.
61.	Barbossa explains that to break the curse, they must return Cortes's gold medallions, as well as blood from every person who took them (or one of his or her descendants).	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 57:55–58:24.
62.	Barbossa is missing a medallion and blood from a single crewmember—Bill Turner, Will's father.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 57:55–58:24.
63.	Believing Elizabeth to be Turner's child (because she had the medallion and claimed to be named Turner), Barbossa cuts her hand and drops the bloody medallion into the chest.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:11:40–1:12:26.
64.	The curse is not broken by Elizabeth's blood.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:12:26–1:13:12.
65.	Will knocks out Sparrow and saves Elizabeth.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:11:52–1:12:00, 1:13:48–1:14:40.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3 4	66.	Barbossa's men capture Sparrow and chase after Will.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:15:04–1:15:54, 1:16:36–1:17:27.
5 6	67.	When the <i>Black Pearl</i> reaches Will, battle ensues.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:23:03–1:30:48.
7 8	68.	Will threatens to render the curse unbreakable by taking his own life.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:31:30–1:32:06.
9 10 11	69.	Barbossa agrees to release Elizabeth and Sparrow, marooning them on the island where he previously marooned Sparrow.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:32:06–1:35:10.
12 13 14	70.	Barbossa keeps Will and Sparrow's crew captive and returns to Isla de la Muerta to break the curse.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:41:26–1:44:13.
15 16 17	71.	On the island, Sparrow and Elizabeth drink rum as Sparrow tells her the <i>Black Pearl</i> represents freedom.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:36:44–1:37:43.
18 19	72.	Sparrow collapses, drunk, and Elizabeth uses the rum to build a fire.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:38:29–1:39:30.
20 21 22	73.	The Navy sees the plumes and rescues Elizabeth and Sparrow.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:39:45–1:39:55.
222324	74.	Once aboard Norrington's ship, Elizabeth pleads with Norrington to rescue Will.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:39:52–1:40:14.
25262728	75.	Elizabeth promises to marry Norrington, and asks him to save Will "as a wedding gift"; Norrington agrees.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:40:39–1:41:25.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3 4	76.	On Isla de la Muerta, Barbossa again prepares to shed Will's blood and break the curse.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:44:00–1:44:36.
5 6 7 8	77.	Sparrow arrives at Isla de la Muerta and tells Barbossa the Navy is outside and suggests he wait to break the curse until after they have defeated the Navy.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:44:34–1:45:35.
9 10 11	78.	Sparrow proposes an alliance, under which he will captain the <i>Black Pearl</i> under Barbossa's colors; Barbossa agrees.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:46:10–1:47:45.
12 13	79.	Barbossa's crew ambushes Norrington's ship by walking under the water.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:48:11–1:48:56.
14 15 16	80.	Elizabeth boards the <i>Black Pearl</i> and frees Sparrow's crew.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:52:52–1:53:54, 1:57:42–1:57:50.
17 18	81.	Sparrow's crew promptly sails off and leaves Elizabeth to head to Isla de la Muerta.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:58:00–1:58:25.
19 20 21 22	82.	On Isla de la Muerta, Barbossa stabs Sparrow, but Sparrow survives—he has taken a piece of Cortes's treasure and is also cursed with immortality.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:55:18–1:55:50.
2324	83.	Elizabeth saves Will and the two begin battling pirate guards.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 1:59:43–2:00:43.
252627	84.	Sparrow and Will break the curse just as Sparrow shoots Barbossa in the heart.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 2:00:43–2:01:30.
- 1			

	Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
85.	Barbossa's crew is no longer immortal and surrenders.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 2:01:30–2:03:10.
86.	Later in Port Royal, the Navy prepares to hang Sparrow for piracy.	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 2:04:29–2:06:27.
87.	Elizabeth declares her love for Will, and the two help Sparrow escape to the <i>Black Pearl</i> .	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 2:07:55–2:08:51.
88.	The movie ends with Sparrow humming "Yo ho, a pirate's life for me."	• Gray Decl. Ex. A [Motion Picture] at 2:12:44–2:13:03.
		ning to Plaintiffs' "Pirates of the lay (the "Screenplay")
89.	Tova Laiter sent the Screenplay to Brigham Taylor at Disney Pictures with a cover letter (the "Cover Letter").	• Dkt. 1-2. ⁵
90.	The Cover Letter states, "here is a brand new spec screenplay."	• Dkt. 1-2.
91.	The Cover Letter describes the Screenplay as "a swashbuckling fun adventure, 'Goonies' meets 'Pirates of the Caribbean.'"	• Dkt. 1-2.
92.	The Cover Letter describes the Screenplay as having "the image and expectations families associate with the Disney ride."	• Dkt. 1-2.
93.	The Cover Letter states that the Screenplay "is also further along	• Dkt. 1-2.

⁵ The Cover Letter is also attached as an exhibit to the First Amended Complaint at Dkt. 112-2 at 2.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2		than your development project, so	Supporting Lyidence
3		yours can be the sequel!"	
4	94.	The Cover Letter includes a postscript stating, "Please let me	• Dkt. 1-2.
5		know as soon as possible as I have a	
6 7		draft that does not have the Disney song or the Ride references that I	
8		plan to take to other studios."	
9	95.	Plaintiffs pleaded that they "envision[ed] their screenplay	• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] ¶ 26.
10		incorporating the basic elements of	
11		the Pirates of the Caribbean ride."	
12	96.	Plaintiffs entitled their Screenplay <i>Pirates of the Caribbean</i> .	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 1, 6.6
13			• Dkt. 1-2.
14	97.	The Screenplay was accompanied	• Dkt. 1-1 at 3.
15 16		by concept art with the tagline "IT ISN'T JUST A RIDE ANY	
17		MORE" above an image of a skull and cross bones wearing a pirate	
18		cap.	
19	98.	Plaintiffs prepared a one-minute	• Dkt. 112 [FAC] ¶ 57.
20		trailer for the Screenplay, which they called a "sizzle reel."	• Dkt. 112-4.
21	99.	The "sizzle reel" uses content	• Compare, e.g., Dkt. 112-4 at 0:22–
22	,,,,	recorded from the Ride.	0:33 (sizzle reel's use of Ride's
23			skeleton helmsman), 0:05–0:16, 0:26–0:43 (sizzle reel's use of
24			Ride's "Yo Ho" song), 0:19-0:23
25			(sizzle reel's use of Ride's "Dead men tell no tales"), 0:49–0:55
26			(sizzle reel's use of warning from

⁶ References to page numbers of the Screenplay are to the ECF numbering at Dkt. 1-1. A black and white scan of the Screenplay (with differing ECF pagination) is also attached to Plaintiffs' First Amended Complaint as Dkt. 112-2.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3 4 5 6 7 8			Ride); with Jessen Decl. Ex. A at 21:45–21:50 (showing skeleton helmsman in the Ride), 25:05–26:43, 27:16–27:35 (showing "Yo Ho" song in Ride), 20:03–20:50 (showing "Dead men tell no tales" in Ride); Parras Decl. Ex. B at 5:38-6:00 (showing warning from Ride).
9 10 11	100.	The Screenplay includes six children, ranging in ages from seven to fifteen, known as "the Rascal Scoundrels."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 19–20.
12 13	101.	The Screenplay has a prologue.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 8–19.
14 15 16 17 18 19	102.	The Screenplay's prologue includes an action sequence.	 Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 8–19. Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 9 ("Jack buries his fist into Davey's gut who buckles in pain."), 10 ("The first mate is blasted off the ship!"), 15 ("The crew closes in, swords thrusting forward.")
20 21 22 23 24	103.	The Screenplay's prologue includes an attack by a sea monster.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 16 ("For a quick second, we see a HUGE TENTACLE submerging back under the deck."), 17 (Captain Jack: "That be no WHALE!" "The ship is under ferocious attack").
25262728	104.	The Screenplay's prologue also features a treasure map, a pirate named Davey Jones, his pirate love interest Jane, and his pirate adversary Jack Nefarious.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 8–19.

	Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
105.	After the prologue, the Screenplay features an auction of wenches.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 19 ("A group of pirates surround a podium. A sign above reads: 'TAKE A WENCH FER YER BRIDE."").
106.	The "WOMAN IN RED" is at the center of the auction.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 20–21 ("LINED UP ON A STAGE is a group of WENCHES, all of them large and porky, except for a WOMAN IN RED ravishing, sultry with long red hair, irresistible to any man").
107.	During the auction of wenches, a "GROUP OF PIRATES" remarks "We wants the REDHEAD!"	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 21.
108.	The Rascal Scoundrels steal pirates' clothing and return to their ship.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 25–30 ("SIX DRUNK MIDGETS are stumbling out of a tavern the midgets are attacked and yanked back into the dark alley OUT WALK THE RASCAL SOUNDRELS in their new clothes.").
109.	The Rascal Scoundrels call Davey Jones their "Captain."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 30–31.
110.	The Screenplay states that Phantom Jack Nefarious' pirate crew's "faces are painted into TRIBAL SKULLS INTIMIDATING."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 53.
111.	The Screenplay includes a scene where Davey "swiftly kicks the skull-faced pirate dead in the balls As the skull-faced pirate	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 57.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3		buckles in pain, he lets go of his sword"	
4 5 6 7 8	112.	At the end of the Screenplay, Davey Jones is "PRIVATEER CAPTAIN," and he and Jane are joined by the Rascal Scoundrels in "[r]espectable" and "[c]lean BRITISH PRIVATEER clothes."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 109–111.
9	113.	At the end of the Screenplay, Davey Jones says, "I owe it all to them," referring to the Rascal Scoundrels.	Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 110.
11 12 13	114.	The Rascal Scoundrel Clumsy overcomes his stutter.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 110 ("Clumsy didn't stutter! Amazed, all heads turn toward him.").
14 15 16 17	115.	Davey Jones and the Rascal Scoundrels defeat Captain Nefarious and find two halves of a map that lead them to a cave full of treasure.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 86–96.
17 18 19 20	116.	The Screenplay ends with the Rascal Scoundrels in naval uniforms and Davey saying "I owe it all to them."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 109–110.
21 22 23 24	117.	The Screenplay describes a scene as being set in a "cavern like the DISNEYLAND RIDE, 'PIRATES OF THE CARIBBEAN," where the Rascal Scoundrels ride a boat down a waterfall.	Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 98.
252627	118.	While in the cavern, the Rascal Scoundrels pass skeletons impaled by swords into the walls.	Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 98 ("Off to the side, SKELETONS OF PIRATES IMPALED BY

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3			SWORDS, PINNED TO THE ROCKY WALLS.").
4 5 6 7 8	119.	While in the cavern, "[a]n eerie voice echoes throughout the cavern" that says "No fear have ye of evil curses says you no fear of plunderin' pirates lurking in every cove, says you."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 97–100.
9 10	120.	The Screenplay quotes the song "Yo-Ho (A Pirate's Life for Me)."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 39, 40, 52, 73, 109.
11 12	121.	The Screenplay includes the line "dead men tell no tales."	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 10, 19, 105.
13 14	Uncontroverted Facts Fertaining to Similarities		
15 16 17	122.	Plaintiffs "envision[ed] their screenplay incorporating the basic elements of the <i>Pirates of the Caribbean</i> ride."	• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] ¶ 26.
18 19 20	123.	Plaintiffs in fact "incorporate[ed] the basic elements of the <i>Pirates of the Caribbean</i> ride" into their Screenplay.	• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] ¶ 26; Dkt 1-2 [Cover Letter].
21 22 23	124.	Plaintiffs titled their screenplay "Pirates of the Caribbean" after the Disney Ride.	• Dkt. 112 [FAC] ¶ 49.
232425	125.	Plaintiffs' Screenplay has "the image and expectations families associate with the Disney ride."	• Dkt. 1-2 [Cover Letter].
262728	126.	Plaintiffs' Screenplay is set in the same place as the Ride (the Caribbean).	Dkt. 112-6 [Román Report] at 19 ("The Screenplay's setting is primarily located on the Caribbean

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3			seas where much of the action unfolds.").
4 5 6	127.	Plaintiffs' Screenplay is set in the same pirate genre as the Ride.	• Dkt. 1-2 [Cover Letter].
7 8	128.	Plaintiffs incorporated various specific "Ride references" into their Screenplay.	• Dkt. 1-2 [Cover letter]
9 10 11 12 13	129.	Among these "Ride references," Plaintiffs repeatedly incorporated the phrase "Pirates of the Caribbean" or "Pirate of the Caribbean" into the Screenplay.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 11, 29, 103.
14 15 16 17 18	130.	Plaintiffs used the Ride's tagline ("Sail with the wildest crew that ever sacked the Spanish Main") as the Screenplay's tagline and incorporated it into Screenplay's dialogue.	 Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 1, 15. Cline Decl. Ex. A [Poster with tagline].
19 20 21	131.	Plaintiffs took the Ride's theme song ("Yo Ho (A Pirate's Life for Me)") and used it in the Screenplay.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 39, 40, 52, 73, 109.
22232425	132.	Plaintiffs' named the orphans in the Screenplay "Rascal Scoundrels" which is part of a lyric in "Yo Ho": "We're rascals, scoundrels, and knaves."	• Cline Decl. ¶ 5; Parras Decl. Ex. B [Ride footage] at 6:43–6:46.
26 27	133.	Plaintiffs named the "Rascal Scoundrels" after that lyric.	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 74.
28			

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3	134.	Plaintiffs took dialogue from the Ride and used it in the Screenplay,	• E.g., Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 10, 19, 21, 82, 86, 100, 105, 109.
4		including the refrain "Dead men tell no tales."	17, 21, 62, 66, 166, 163, 167.
5		no tales.	
6	135.	Plaintiffs incorporated the Ride's	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 19.
7		bride auction (including aspects of its staging, characters, such as "the	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland
8		redhead," and dialogue, such as	1968 Program] at 23:21–24:15.
9		"We wants the redhead!") into the Screenplay.	
10			
11 12	136.	In Plaintiffs' Screenplay, "the redhead" from the bride auction is	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 19, 40, 42.
13		the character Jane.	
14	137.	Plaintiffs incorporated some of the	Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 37
15		Ride's depictions of skeleton pirates	("STREAKS OF LIGHTNING
16		into the Screenplay.	SPLATTER THE SKY, FOLLOWED BY THUNDER! At
17			that instant, A SKELETON WEARING RAGGED PIRATE'S
18			CLOTHING is seen steering the
19			ship!").
20 21			 Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 98 ("Off to the side, SKELETONS OF
22			PIRATES IMPALED BY SWORDS, PINNED TO THE
23			ROCKY WALLSas if battle took
24			place years ago").
25			 Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland 1968 Program] at 20:40, 21:45.
26	120		
27	138.	Plaintiffs incorporated a "cavern like the DISNYLAND RIDE,	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 98.
28		·	

1		II.	Commond's a E * 1
2		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
3		'PIRATES of THE CARIBBEAN'" into the Screenplay.	
4		inco inco z crocing inju	
5	139.	1 1	• Dkt. 1-1 [Screenplay] at 5.
6		Screenplay incorporates skeleton pirates photographed from the Ride.	• Jessen Decl. Ex. A [Disneyland
7		priaces priotographed from the rade.	1968 Program] at 20:59, 21:53.
8			• Cline Decl. Ex. B [E-Ticket
9			Magazine] at 6.
10		Uncontroverted Facts Pertaining to	Plaintiffs' Expert David Román
11	1.40		
12	140.	Plaintiffs' expert David Román opines that "The Screenplay brings	• Dkt. 112-6 [Román Report] at 5, 6.
13		something entirely original to this	• Dkt. 139 [Román Rebuttal Report] at 4.
14		traditional narrative by incorporating a humorous tone to	at 4.
15		the story."	
16	141.	Román opines that the presence of	Dkt. 112-6 [Román Report] at 8.
17		two sets of "male leads" is an "unusual similarity" between the	
18		Screenplay and the Motion Picture.	
19	142.	Román opines that Screenplay	Dkt. 112-6 [Román Report] at 9.
20		"ingeniously blurs two stock characters," the "archetypal	
21		swashbuckler" and the "pirate," "to	
22		create a new type of protagonist with the qualities of both character	
23		types."	
24	143.	Plaintiffs' original complaint	• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] ¶ 10.
25		pleaded that "[f]ilms have covered	
26		swashbuckling pirates," then listed nine movies that predated Plaintiffs'	
27		screenplay, "among many others."	
28			

-		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3 4	144.	Román opines that women and young girls "generally are not the [pirate] genre's targeted audience."	Dkt. 112-6 [Román Report] at 11.
5 6 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7 7	145.	Román opines that there is "no precedent in the genre of the pirate story to encourage such a prologue; in fact, it's highly atypical"	Dkt. 112-6 [Román Report] at 14.
8 9 0 0	146.	Román opines that the "element of romance" was one of the Screenplay's "major innovations to the typical pirate story."	 Dkt. 112-6 [Román Report] at 17. Dkt. 139 [Román Rebuttal Report] at 4.
1 2 3 4 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5 5	147.	Plaintiffs' original complaint pleaded nine pirate movies by name, "among many others," and stated that "the majority of these pirates [sic] films have a love story/triangle."	• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] at ¶ 10.
6 7 8	148.	Román opines that James McDonald's consideration of other works in the pirate genre was misguided because "other pirate movies are irrelevant to this case."	• Dkt. 139 [Román Rebuttal Report] at 1.
9 - 0 - 1 -	149.	Plaintiffs' original complaint pleaded nine other pirate movies by name "among many others."	• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] at ¶ 10.
2 3 4	150.	Román opines that the 1827 James Fenimore Cooper novel <i>The Red</i> <i>Rover</i> is an "obscure work[]" that is "not widely known."	Dkt. 139 [Román Rebuttal Report] at 2.
5	151.	Plaintiffs' original complaint included <i>The Red Rover</i> as one of eight pirate novels mentioned by name.	• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] at ¶ 8.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3 4 5	152.		Dkt. 139 [Román Rebuttal Report] at 11.
6 7	153.	Román opines that "[t]here was no 'ghost ship' anywhere in the Ride[.]"	• Dkt. 139 [Román Rebuttal Report] at 16.
8 9 10	154.	Román opines that "the Ride provides no backstory that discloses whether any pirates were cursed[.]"	• Dkt. 139 [Román Rebuttal Report] at 16.
11 12 13 14 15	155.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "Do you consider yourself as an expert in the Pirate genre?" Román testified, "No."	 Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 17:18–18:15. Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 94:9–11 ("I would say I wouldn't name myself as having an expertise in pirate stories.").
16 17 18 19 20 21	156.	Román testified that the question whether someone is an expert in the pirate genre is "tricky because it assumes that there is such a thing as a pirate genre I don't know that I would necessarily identify the pirate stores having a genre of itself."	 Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 18:6–15. Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 107:1–3 ("I wouldn't necessarily say that it is an established genre").
22232425	157.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "do you consider yourself an expert in pirate literature?" Román testified, "I consider myself having familiarity with pirate literature."	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 18:16–20.
262728	158.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "And did you receive any specific instructions about what standards you should apply in	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 21:25–22:7.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2		comparing the works for	~ apporting = 1200000
3		similarities?" Román testified,	
4		"No. Not really. I mean, this is	
5		partly that I had my own set of criteria that I was using. Which I	
6		explained to the lawyers earlier on,	
7		that this is how I think, this is the	
		kind of the work that I do, this is what a comparatist does."	
8	159.	-	Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at
9	107.	asked, "Did you also feel that there	26:17–24.
10		were any significant differences between the works at that time?"	
11		Román testified, "Yeah, no, of	
12		course. There are obvious	
13		differences between the two works that—that are immediately	
14		apparent."	
15	160.	Román testified, "I will say this and	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at
16		again, this is with complete respect	38:12–14.
17		to all parties involved. I had no idea what they wanted me to do	
18		with this report, right?"	
19	161.	Román testified, "I am just going to	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at
20		say what I said earlier. You know, I	44:25–45:13.
21		think that, from my understanding, my job was to read a screenplay and	
22		screen a film. And see what the	
23		overlap, if any, there was between them. So I kind of stayed clean to	
24		that mission, right? And that's been	
25		my guiding principal throughout.	
		What's in the screenplay, what's in in the film, what, if anything – what	
26		if any correspondence are there	
27		between them So I kept it	
28		pretty—I would use the word clean,	

1		Uncontroverted Feet	Supporting Evidence
2		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
3		kept it pretty clean. So I just though I'm looking at the screenplay, I am	
4 5		screening the film. I was tasked to do a comparative analysis of the two."	
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	162.	At his deposition, Román was asked whether his counsel told him "anything about what standards governed the comparison of works for substantial similarity in copyright cases." Román testified, "There was just a couple of notes that, verbal, that I wasn't sure if I was supposed to write out all the things that I didn't find to be corresponding. So the dissimilarities. And I was informed that copyright laws aren't necessary interested in what doesn't correspond but what does	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 47:19–48:14.
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27	163.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "So other than being instructed to disregard dissimilarities between the two works, were you given any other information about the legal standards governing copyright cases?" Román testified, "No. I mean, I think that there was some kind of casual conversations about copyright infringement cases You know what it felt like? It felt like, you know, conversations in the hall But it didn't seem relevant to what I was tasked to do."	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 48:10–49:11.

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	164.		• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 65:12–16.
9 10 11 12	165.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "Have you ever heard something called the extrinsic test for substantial similarity?" Román testified, "Not that I can recollect."	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 66:1–5.
13 14 15 16 17 18	166.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "In conducting your analysis of the two works at issue here, did you make any effort whatsoever to distinguish between protectable and unprotectable elements of the two works?" Román testified, "I wasn't using the grid, the legal grid to write up my report, if that's what you're referring to."	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 68:9–24.
20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27 28	167.	In forming his original opinions, Román did not review other works in the pirate genre to determine whether individual elements in the screenplay and the Motion Picture were original to the Screenplay.	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 87:3–9 ("Q: But you didn't go out and review pirate works to determine whether other pirate works incorporated a humorous tone into the story— A: No, no, and I wasn't asked to do that. That wasn't a task at hand."); 146:23–147:12 ("Q: From the time you were retained to the time you generated your report, you didn't review other pirates works to determine whether individual

1	Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2 3 4		elements in the works you were comparing were original to the screenplay, right? A: Right. Because my task was very clear
5		which is they wanted me to look at
6		the screenplay and look at the film and base my analysis on that.");
7		161:18–162:3 ("Q: And you
8		weren't personally familiar with all of the works in Mr.
9 10		McDonald's report, were you? A: No. No I did ask [Plaintiffs'
11		counsel] Aleks and Steven if it was important for me to review those
12		materials. Like, do I need to read
13		up on all of that? And their answer was absolutely not.").
14	168. At his deposition, Román was	• Gray Dool Ev. D [Domán Don lat
15	asked, "So I am asking you, is it	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 74:2–24.
16	your opinion as an expert on expressing an opinion about	
17	substantial similarities that all of the	
18	similarities you have described in your expert report relate to	
19	protectable elements of the work?"	
20	Román testified, "Let me answer it this way. You know, when I read	
21	the screenplay, I formed an opinion	
22	on the quality of the screenplay, its innovations, what I found	
23	interesting, what I found unusual,	
24	all of that, which I said several times already today. Then, when I	
25	screened the film and I saw some of	
26	those echoes, I thought, well, this is interesting. It does feel like	
27	copyright infringement. So, if what	
28	I identify as original and particular	

1	Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2	to the screenplay, I think should be	
3	protected by copyright law. But, again, I am not a lawyer and I am	
4	just saying that it does seem to me	
5	that the qualities in the screenplay	
6	that I have identified as original, even if they can be reduced to	
7	scènes à faire from an	
3	unimaginative limited perspective, I think that misses the importance of	
•	the contribution in the screenplay."	
169	Román testified that, other than <i>The</i>	Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at
	Goonies, which he watched "at the last minute" before submitting his	100:18–101:1.
2	expert report, he did not review any	
.	other works in the pirate genre	
1776	before submitting his expert report.	
	At his deposition, Román was asked, "What was the last pirate	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 117:7–11.
	novel you read?" Román testified,	
	"Hamnet."	
171	At his deposition, Román was asked, "At the time you were	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at
	preparing your original report, you	147:16–25.
	understood that both works were	
	inspired in part by the Pirates of the Caribbean them park ride, didn't	
	you?" Román testified, "I didn't	
1.776	know that there was a theme park."	
	Román testified, "Do I think it is important to know the source	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 151:16–23.
;	material when comparing two	131.10 23.
	works that share a same source	
	absolutely helps to know the source	
27 28	material? I would say, yeah, it	

1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
2	173.		Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at
3		asked, "Are you familiar with Long	169:23–25.
4		John Silver from <i>Treasure Island</i> ?" Román testified, "I wasn't asked to	
5		screen that."	
6	174.		• Dkt. 1 [Complaint] at ¶¶ 8, 10;
7		famous works of pirate literature.	Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 107:18-25.
8	175		
9	175.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "Are you saying that there is	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 199:3–14.
10		no precedence for the use of a prologue in general in pirate stories,	
11		or are you saying there is something	
12 13		specific about the prologue that lacks any precedence in pirate	
14		stories?" Román testified, "I would	
15		even just go that prologues are an incredibly unusual literary device at	
16		large. Like, there are not, like, a lot	
17		of literary texts that start off with a prologue."	
18	176.	At his deposition, Román was	Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at
19		asked, "Did [counsel] give you anything in writing explaining your	275:9–13.
20		assignment or your conveying the	
21		legal standards?" Román testified, "No, no. I kind of – a part of me	
22		wished that they had, but no, that	
23	4 = =	wasn't the case."	
24	177.	At his deposition, Román was asked, "So at the time you signed	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 323:16–20.
25		and submitted your initial expert	323.10 20.
26		report in this matter, you had never seen footage of the Walt Disney	
27		ride?" Román testified, "I can	
28			

	_		1
1		Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
3		answer that confidently that I didn't see any footage of it."	
4 5 6 7 8	178.	At his deposition, Román was asked whether, at the time he signed and submitted his initial expert report in this matter, whether he had "[ever] ridden the Walt Disney ride?" Román testified, "No."	• Gray Decl. Ex. B [Román Dep.] at 323:16–24.
9	Un	controverted Facts Pertaining to De	fendant's Expert, James McDonald
10 11 12 13	179.	James McDonald's report includes a section titled "Assignment and Applicable Standards" in which he describes the "extrinsic test" for substantial similarity.	• Dkt. 133-1 [McDonald Report] at 2–3.
14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26	180.	In forming his expert opinions, McDonald reviewed works in the pirate genre other than the Screenplay and the Motion Picture, including the "works cited in paragraph 8 of Plaintiffs' original Complaint: A General History of the Pyrates, Robinson Crusoe, Treasure Island, Peter Pan, Captain Singleton, The Pirate, The Gold-Bug, The Coral Island, and The Red Rover,"; the "films cited in paragraph 10 of Plaintiffs' original complaint: Treasure Island, Peter Pan, Savage Island, The Buccaneer, The Pirate, The Island, Captain Blood, Blackbeard the Pirate, and Yellowbeard"; The Goonies; and Cutthroat Island.	• Dkt. 133-1 [McDonald Report] at 3-4.
27 28	181.	In forming his expert opinions, McDonald reviewed footage of the	• Dkt. 133-1 [McDonald Report] at 3, 6, 8–10, 18, 21, 24, 27–29.

	Uncontroverted Fact	Supporting Evidence
		Supporting Evidence
	Disneyland theme park ride "Pirates of the Caribbean."	
182.	McDonald assessed both works under the extrinsic test for	• Dkt. 133-1 [McDonald Report] at
	substantial similarity and opines	5–23.
	that they are "fundamentally dissimilar."	
183	McDonald's report includes a	• Dist 122 1 [MaDonald Danaut] at
103.	section titled "Novelty Analysis," in	• Dkt. 133-1 [McDonald Report] at 23–30.
	which he analyzes whether the similarities identified in Román's	
	expert report are original to	
	Plaintiffs' Screenplay and/or whether they originated in the Ride.	
184.	McDonald determined that many of	Dkt. 133-1 [McDonald Report] at
	the "similarities" identified by Plaintiffs were generic pirate genre	23–30.
	tropes, stock elements, and scenes a	
	faire.	
185.	McDonald testified that, at the time he was engaged as an expert in	• Gray Decl. Ex. C [McDonald Dep.] at 59:21–61:04.
	2017, he had "been looking at the	2 op. j av 27.21 01.0 ii
	pirate genre for some time," including in connection with a	
	previous engagement on another	
	case involving <i>Pirates of the Caribbean</i> .	
DATED: September 7, 2021 MUNGER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP		ER, TOLLES & OLSON LLP
	D	/_/ ID
	$\frac{\text{By:}}{\text{JO}}$	/s/ Jordan D. Segall RDAN D. SEGALL
	Attorne	rys for Defendant Walt Disney Picture.
	-29-	